## Open Letter to Dr. Margaret Chan, Director-General, WHO (Copied to the International Olympic Committee)

We are writing to express our concern about the upcoming Olympic and Paralympic Games in Rio de Janeiro. WHO's declaration of Zika as a "Public Health Emergency of International Concern," coupled with new scientific findings that underscore the seriousness of that problem, call for the Rio 2016 Games to be postponed and/or moved to another location—but not cancelled—in the name of public health.

We make this call despite the widespread fatalism that the Rio 2016 Games are inevitable or "too big to fail". History teaches this is wrong: the 1916, 1940, and 1944 Olympic Games were not just postponed, but cancelled, and other sporting events were moved because of disease, as Major League Baseball did for Zika, and the Africa Cup of Nations did for Ebola.

Currently, many athletes, delegations, and journalists are struggling with the decision of whether to participate in the Rio 2016 Games. We agree with the U.S. Centers for Disease Control recommendation that workers should "Consider delaying travel to areas with active Zika virus transmission". If that advice were followed uniformly, no athlete would have to choose between risking disease and participating in a competition that many have trained for their whole lives.

But our greater concern is for global health. The Brazilian strain of Zika virus harms health in ways that science has not observed before. An unnecessary risk is posed when 500,000 foreign tourists from all countries attend the Games, potentially acquire that strain, and return home to places where it can become endemic. Should that happen to poor, as-yet unaffected places (e.g., most of South Asia and Africa) the suffering can be great. It is unethical to run the risk, just for Games that could proceed anyway, if postponed and/or moved.

In our view, several new scientific findings require WHO to reconsider its advice on the 2016 Olympic and Paralympic Games. For example:

- 1. That the Brazilian viral strain causes microcephaly<sup>2</sup> and probably Guillain-Barré syndrome<sup>3</sup>. Further, because human<sup>4</sup>, animal<sup>5</sup> and *in vitro* studies<sup>6</sup> demonstrate that the virus is neurotrophic and causes cell death, it is biologically plausible that there are other as yet undiscovered neurological injuries, as exist for similar viruses (e.g. dengue).<sup>7</sup>
- 2. That while Zika's risk to any single individual is low, the risk to a population is undeniably high. Currently, Brazil's government reports 120,000 probable Zika cases,<sup>8</sup> and 1,300 confirmed cases of microcephaly (with another 3,300 under investigation)<sup>9</sup>, which is above the historical level of microcephaly.<sup>10</sup>
- 3. That Rio de Janeiro is highly affected by Zika. Brazil's government reports Rio de Janeiro state has the second-highest number of probable Zika cases in the country (32,000) and the fourth-highest incidence rate (195 per 100,000), demonstrating active transmission.<sup>8</sup>

- 4. That despite Rio's new mosquito-killing program, the transmission of mosquito-borne disease has gone up rather than down. While Zika is a new epidemic and lacks historical data, using dengue fever as a proxy, cases in Rio from January thru April 2016 are up 320% and 1150% over the same periods in 2015 and 2014, respectively. In the specific neighborhood of the Olympic Park (Barra da Tijuca) there have been more dengue cases in just the first quarter of 2016 than in all of 2015.
- 5. That Rio's health system is so severely weakened as to make a last-minute push against Zika impossible. Recently Rio's state government declared a health sector emergency, <sup>12</sup> and Rio's city government cut funding against mosquito-borne disease by 20%. <sup>13</sup> While the virus is the infectious *agent* of Zika, its real *cause* is Rio's poor social conditions and sanitation—factors that lack a quick fix, and that are not helped when shrinking health resources are diverted to the Games.
- 6. That it is possible to eradicate the *Aedes aegypti* mosquito, which transmits Zika, from Rio. Actually that mosquito was totally <u>eradicated</u> from Brazil in the 1950s, but came back after control efforts lapsed.<sup>14</sup> Thus holding the Games, in the presence of Zika-carrying mosquitoes, is a choice and not necessary.
- 7. That one cannot count on nature for defence. While lower mosquito activity during Rio's winter months reduces the individual risk to travelers of infection, that is partly offset when travelers who became infected return home during the northern hemisphere's summer months and peak mosquito activity, which increases the public health risk that local mosquitos acquire and spread the virus—meaning that <u>both</u> seasons are relevant to the epidemic's course. <sup>15</sup> Also, infection can spread through blood donations and transfusions, particularly in poor countries that lack screening for Zika. <sup>16</sup>

In sum, the evidence shows: (i) that Brazil's Zika virus strain has more serious medical consequences than previously known, (ii) that Rio de Janeiro is one of the most affected parts of Brazil, and (iii) that Rio's mosquito-killing efforts are not meeting expectations, but rather mosquito-borne disease is up this year. It is therefore imperative that WHO conduct a fresh, evidence-based assessment of Zika and the Games, and its recommendations for travelers.

Because Zika is a new emergency, its many uncertainties—of travel flows during the Games, of epidemiology, and of entomology—currently make it impossible for mathematical models to predict the epidemic's course accurately. Therefore, for now, any decision about Zika and the Games has to be more qualitative than quantitative. If one considers the following options:

- (a) Holding the Games in Rio in 2016 as scheduled;
- (b) Holding the Games in Rio at a later date after Zika is controlled, and;
- (c) Holding the Games at Zika-free sites having Olympic-standard facilities.

It is indisputable that option (a) of holding the Games as scheduled has a greater risk of accelerating the spread of the Brazilian viral strain than the alternatives. Postponing and/or moving the Games also mitigates other risks brought on by historic turbulence in Brazil's economy, governance, and society at large—which are not isolated problems, but context that

makes the Zika problem all but impossible to solve with the Games fast approaching.

We are concerned that WHO is rejecting these alternatives because of a conflict of interest. Specifically, WHO entered into an official partnership with the International Olympic Committee, in a Memorandum of Understanding that remains secret. There is no good reason for WHO not to disclose this Memorandum of Understanding, as is standard practice for conflicts of interest. Not doing so casts doubt on WHO's neutrality, for reasons described further in the Appendix.

WHO must revisit the question of Zika and postponing and/or moving the Games. We recommend that WHO convene an independent group to advise it and the IOC in a transparent, evidence-based process in which science, public health, and the spirit of sport come first. Given the public health and ethical consequences, not doing so is irresponsible.

Signatories follow in **alphabetical** order, and represent individuals, not their institutions Appendix and references at the end

Authors: Prof. Amir Attaran (University of Ottawa: aattaran@uottawa.ca)
Prof. Arthur Caplan (New York University, USA: arthur.caplan@nyumc.org)
Dr. Christopher Gaffney (University of Zürich: christopher.gaffney@geo.uzh.ch)
Prof. Lee Igel (New York University, USA: lee.igel@nyu.edu)

- 1. Prof. Akira Akabayashi, Department of Biomedical Ethics, School of Public Health, The University of Tokyo Faculty of Medicine, Tokyo, Japan
- 2. Prof. Paul S. Appelbaum, Director, Division of Law, Ethics & Psychiatry, Department of Psychiatry, Columbia University, New York, USA
- 3. Prof. Kwame Anthony Appiah, Department of Philosophy, NYU Law, New York University, New York, USA
- 4. Prof. Thalia Arawi, Founding Director, Salim El-Hoss Bioethics & Professionalism Program, Faculty of Medicine, American University of Beirut, Beirut, Lebanon
- 5. Prof. Amir Attaran, School of Epidemiology, Public Health and Community Medicine and Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Canada
- 6. Ms. Stephanie Augustine, Researcher, Department of Maternal Fetal Medicine, North Shore University Hospital, Manhasset, USA
- 7. Prof. Robert Baker, Bioethics Program of Clarkson University & The Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, Schenectady, USA
- 8. Dr. Alison Bateman-House, Division of Medical Ethics, Department of Population Health, New York University School of Medicine, New York, USA
- 9. Prof. Frances Batzer, Department of Obstetrics & Gynecology, Thomas Jefferson University, Philadelphia, USA

- 10. Prof. Angelica M. Baylon, External Relations Director, Maritime Academy of Asia, Kamaya Point, Philippines
- 11. Prof. Solly Benatar, Founding Director, University of Cape Town Bioethics Centre, Department of Medicine, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa
- 12. Prof. Cecilia Benoit, Centre for Addictions Research of British Columbia, Department of Sociology, University of Victoria, Victoria, Canada
- 13. Mr. Edward J. Bergman, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA
- 14. Prof. Kenneth Berkowitz, Department of Population Health and Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, New York University, New York, USA
- 15. Prof. Ivy Lynn Bourgeault, Canadian Institutes of Health Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health Human Resources Telfer School of Management, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 16. Prof. Marie A. Bragg, Department of Population Health, New York University School of Medicine, New York, USA
- 17. Dr Berit Bringedal, Senior Researcher, Institute for Studies of the Medical Profession, Oslo, Norway
- 18. Prof. Amy Brown, Maria Fareri Children's Hospital at Westchester Medical Center, Department of Pediatrics, New York Medical College, Valhalla, USA
- 19. Prof. Arthur L. Caplan, Division of Medical Ethics, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 20. Dr. Rhyddhi Chakraborty, Researcher, Philosophical Bioethics, Global Public Health and Social Justice, American University of Sovereign Nations, USA.
- 21. Prof. Theeraphap Chareonviriyaphap, Department of Entomology, Kasetsart University, Bangkok, Thailand
- 22. Prof. Cheryl Cline, Office of Bioethics, Department of Biomedical and Molecular Sciences, Queen's University, Kingston, Canada.
- 23. Dr. Catherine Constable, Instructor, Department of Medicine, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 24. Prof. Glenn Cohen, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology & Bioethics, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, USA
- 25. Prof. Patrick Derr, Chair, Department of Philosophy, Clark University, Worcester, USA
- 26. Prof. Débora Diniz, Faculty of Law, Universidade de Brasília, and Bioethics Program, FIOCRUZ, Brasília and Rio de Janeiro, Brazil
- 27. Prof. Ames Dhai, Director, Steve Biko Centre for Bioethics, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa

- 28. Dr. Hasan Erbay, MD. PhD., Department of Medical Ethics and History of Medicine, Afyon Kocatepe University Faculty of Medicine, Afyonkarahisar, Turkey.
- 29. Prof. Eric Feldman, Health Policy and Medical Ethics, University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, USA
- 30. Dr. Holly Fernandez-Lynch, Executive Director, Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology and Bioethics, Harvard University, USA
- 31. Prof. Chris Feudtner, Department of Pediatrics and Department of Medical Ethics, Perelman School of Medicine at the University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA
- 32. Dr. Christopher Gaffney, Department of Geography, University of Zürich, Zürich, Switzerland
- 33. Prof. William Gardner, Children's Hospital of Eastern Ontario Research Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 34. Prof. Robert P. George, McCormick Professor of Jurisprudence, Princeton University, Princeton, USA
- 35. Prof. Grover Gilmore, Dean, Applied Social Sciences, Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, USA
- 36. Prof. Moti Gorin, Director, Jann Benson Ethics Center, Colorado State University, USA
- 37. Prof. Linda Granowetter, Department of Pediatrics, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 38. Prof. Abhik Gupta, Ph.D., Professor and Dean, School of Environmental Sciences, Assam (Central) University, Silchar, India.
- 39. Prof. Sally Guttmacher, College of Global Public Health, New York University, New York, USA
- 40. Prof. Negin Hajizadeh, Department of Medicine, Hofstra Northwell School of Medicine, Hofstra University, Hempstead, USA.
- 41. Mr. George Halvorson, Chief Executive (Retired) Kaiser Permanente, and Chair, InterGroup Understanding, Sausalito, USA
- 42. Prof. Deborah S. Hamm, Department of Psychiatry, Columbia University Medical Center, New York, USA
- 43. Prof. Alice Herb, Division of Humanities in Medicine at State University of New York, Downstate Medical Center, New York, USA
- 44. Prof. Søren Holm, Centre for Social Ethics and Policy, School of Law, University of Manchester, UK.
- 45. Prof. Lee H. Igel, Tisch Institute for Sports Management, Media, and Business, New York University, New York, USA

- 46. Prof. Judy Illes, Canada Research Chair in Neuroethics, Department of Medicine, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada
- 47. Dr. Mahmood-uz- Jahan, M.D., PhD., Director, Bangladesh Medical Research Council, Dhaka, Bangladesh
- 48. Prof. Dale Jamieson, Chair, Department of Environmental Studies, New York University, New York, USA
- 49. Prof. Yeremias Jena, M. Phil., M.Sc, Professor of Medical Ethics at Atma Jaya School of Medicine, Atma Jaya Catholic University of Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia.
- 50. Prof. Steven Joffe, Vice-Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, Department of Pediatrics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine, Philadelphia, USA
- 51. Prof. Ken Johnson, School of Epidemiology, Public Health and Preventive Medicine, University of Ottawa, Canada
- 52. Prof. Nora Jones, Associate Director, Center for Bioethics, Urban Health, and Polic, Lewis Katz School of Medicine, Temple University, Philadelphia, USA
- 53. Prof. Therese Jones, Associate Director, Center for Bioethics and Humanities, Director, Arts and Humanities in Healthcare Program, University of Colorado Anschutz Medical Campus, Denver, USA
- 54. Prof. Matthias A. Karajannis, Division of Pediatric Hematology/Oncology, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 55. Prof. Douglas I. Katz, Department of Neurology, Boston University School of Medicine, Braintree, USA
- 56. Prof. Ralph V. Katz, Professor of Epidemiology, Fellow of the American College of Epidemiology F.A.C.E.), and Founding Chair, Department of Epidemiology and Health Promotion, New York University, New York, USA
- 57. Ms. Lisa Kearns, Research Associate, Division of Medical Ethics, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 58. Prof. Aaron Seth Kesselheim, Division of Pharmacoepidemiology & Pharmacoeconomics, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Harvard University, Boston, USA
- 59. Dr. Abbas Kharabi, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia
- 60. *Dr. Robert Klitzman,* Professor of Psychiatry, Director, Masters of Bioethics Program Columbia University, New York, USA
- 61. Prof. Craig Klugman, Chair, Department of Health Sciences, DePaul University, Chicago, USA
- 62. Prof. Adam Kolber, Center for Health, Science, and Public Policy, Brooklyn Law School, Brooklyn, USA

- 63. Prof. Craig Konnoth, Senior Fellow, Leonard Davis Institute of Health Economics, University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, USA
- 64. Prof. Ralph A. Korpman, School of Medicine, Loma Linda University School of Medicine, Loma Linda, USA
- 65. Dr. Ronald L. Krall, Center for Bioethics and Health Law, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, USA
- 66. Prof. Sheldon Krimsky, Department of Urban and Environmental Policy & Planning, Department of Health and Community Medicine, Tufts University, Boston, USA
- 67. Prof. John Lantos, Director of Pediatric Bioethics, Department of Pediatrics, University of Missouri-Kansas City School of Medicine, Kansas City, USA
- 68. Prof. John Last, School of Epidemiology, Public Health and Preventive Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 69. Prof. Stephen Latham, Director, Interdisciplinary Center for Bioethics, Yale University, New Haven, USA
- 70. Dr. Thuy Le, Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Oxford University, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam
- 71. Prof. Arthur Leader, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 72. Mr. Leonard leBlanc, Research Fellow, Eubios Ethics Institute, Japan.
- 73. Prof. Trudo Lemmens, Scholl Chair in Health Law and Policy, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada
- 74. Prof. Betty Wolder Levin, School of Public Health and Health Policy, City University of New York, New York, USA
- 75. Prof. Bruce Levin, Department of Biostatistics, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, USA
- 76. Prof. Ariane Lewis, Department of Neurology and Department of Neurosurgery, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 77. Dr. Ana Lita, Director, Global Bioethics Initiative, New York, USA
- 78. Prof. Julian Little, Director, School of Epidemiology, Public Health and Preventive Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 79. Prof. Sergio Litewka, Institute for Bioethics and Health Policy, Miller School of Medicine, University of Miami, Miami, USA
- 80. Prof. Alex John London, Director, Center for Ethics and Policy, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, USA
- 81. Prof. Darryl Macer, Ph.D., Hon.D. President, American University of Sovereign Nations, Arizona, USA; Director, Eubios Ethics Institute, Christchurch, New Zealand

- 82. Prof. Tim Mackey, Director, Global Health Policy Institute, Department of Anaesthesology and Public Health, University of California at San Diego, San Diego, USA
- 83. Prof. Ruth Macklin, Department of Epidemiology & Population Health, Albert Einstein College of Medicine, Yeshiva University, New York, USA.
- 84. Prof. Cheryl Macpherson, Bioethics Department, St George's University School of Medicine, True Blue, Grenada
- 85. Prof. Brian Martin, Director, Graduate Program in Public Health, Eastern Virginia Medical School, Old Dominion University, Norfolk, USA
- 86. Prof. Thomas Mayo, Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law, University of Texas Southwestern Medical School, Dallas, USA
- 87. Mr. Michael Mawadri, Emergency Coordinator with Action for Development (AFOD) in South Sudan, South Sudan
- 88. Prof. James McCartney (Reverend, Order of St. Augustine), Department of Philosophy, Villanova University, Villanova, USA
- 89. Prof. John Merz, Department of Medical Ethics & Health Policy, Perelman School of Medicine at the University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA
- 90. Mr. Alan Milstein, Sports Attorney, Sherman, Silverstein, Kohl, Rose & Podolsky, Moorestown, USA
- 91. Prof. Christine Mitchell, Executive Director, Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School, Boston, USA
- 92. Prof. Jonathan D. Moreno, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA
- 93. Prof. Dr. Martin Müller, Department of Geography, University of Zürich, Zurich, Switzerland
- 94. Prof. Carin Muhr, Department of Medical Science, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden.
- 95. Prof. Anna Nolan, Department of Environmental Medicine , Department of Medicine, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 96. Prof. Stjepan Oreskovic, Andrija Stampar School of Public Health, University of Zagreb School of Medicine, Zagreb, Croatia
- 97. Prof. Brendan Parent, Division of Medical Ethics and Co-Director NYU Sports and Society Program, New York University, New York, USA
- 98. Prof. Shamina Parvin Lasker, Head of Department of Anatomy, Samorita Medical College; Secretary General, Bangladesh Bioethics Society, Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- 99. Prof. Pasquale Patrizio, Division of Reproductive Endocrinology & Infertility, Yale School of Medicine, New Haven, Connecticut, USA
- 100. Prof. Sean Philpott-Jones, Department of Bioethics, Clarkson University, Schenectady, NY

- 101. Dr. Carolyn Plunkett, Division of Medical Ethics, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 102. Prof. Stephen G. Post, Department of Family, Population & Preventive Medicine, Stony Brook University School of Medicine, Stony Brook, USA
- 103. Prof. Kathleen Powderly, Director, John Conley Division of Medical Ethics and Humanities, SUNY Downstate Medical Center, Brooklyn, USA
- 104. Prof. Duncan Purves, Environmental Studies and Bioethics, New York University, New York, USA
- 105. Prof. Vojin Rakic, Founding Director, Center for the Study of Bioethics, Head of the European Division of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics, University of Belgrade, Serbia
- 106. Prof. Vardit Ravitsky, School of Public Health, Université de Montréal, Montreal, Canada
- 107. Prof. Avad Raz, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Be'er-Sheva, Israel
- 108. Prof Kathleen Reeves, Director, Center for Bioethics, Urban Health, and Policy, Lewis Katz School of Medicine, Temple University, Philadelphia, USA
- 109. Prof. Donald R. Roberts, Department of Preventive Medicine and Biometrics, Uniformed Services University of the Health Sciences, Bethesda, USA
- 110. Dr. Philip Rubin, Principal Assistant Director (Retired), Office of Science and Technology Policy (OSTP), Executive Office of the President of the United States, New Haven, USA
- 111. Prof William Ruddick, Founding Director, Center for Bioethics, New York University, New York, USA
- 112. Prof. Maya Sabatello, Department of Psychiatry, Columbia University, New York, USA
- 113. Dr. Mojgan Saleuhipour, Faculty of Biomedicine, South Baylo University, CA, USA
- 114. Prof. Judit Sandor, Director of the Center for Ethics and Law in Biomedicine, Central European University, Budapest, Hungary
- 115. Prof. Pamela L. Sankar, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA
- 116. Prof. Arthur Schaefer, Founding Director, Centre for Professional and Applied Ethics, University of Manitoba, Canada
- 117. Prof. Udo Schuklenk, Ontario Research Chair in Bioethics, Department of Philosophy, Queen's University, Kingston, Canada
- 118. Prof. Evan Selinger, Department of Philosophy, Rochester Institute of Technology, Rochester, USA
- 119. Dr. M. Selvanayagam, Professor, Dean of Research and President of India Association of Bioethics, India

- 120. Prof. Seema K. Shah, Department of Pediatrics, University of Washington School of Medicine, Seattle, USA
- 121. Prof. William S. Silvers, University of Colorado Denver School of Medicine, Denver, USA
- 122. Prof. Peter Singer, University Center for Human Values, Princeton University, Princeton, USA; and School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia.
- 123. Prof. Maria Fiatarone Singh, Chair of Exercise and Sport Science, Faculty of Health Sciences, Sydney Medical School, University of Sydney, Australia
- 124. Prof. Daniel Skinner, Assistant Professor of Health Policy, Department of Social Medicine, Ohio University, Dublin, USA
- 125. Raquel R. Smith, Ph.D., Prof. Of Clinical Psychology, American University of Sovereign Nations, Arizona, USA; Community Emergency Response Team (FEMA) Instructor and Manager
- 126. Prof. Robert Smith?, Department of Mathematics and Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 127. Prof. Jeremy Snyder, Faculty of Health Science, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, Canada
- 128. Prof. Robert W. Snyder, Esq. Attorney at Law, Professor of Healthcare Management and Finance, American University of Sovereign Nations School of Medicine, USA.
- 129. Prof. Martin Strosberg, Bioethics Program of Clarkson University & The Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, Schenectady, USA
- 130. Prof. Eileen Sullivan-Marx, Dean, School of Nursing, New York University, New York, USA
- 131. Prof. Edwin van Teijlingen, Centre for Midwifery, Maternal & Perinatal Health, Faculty of Health & Social Sciences, Bournemouth University, Bournemouth, UK
- 132. Prof. Henk ten Have, Director, Center for Healthcare Ethics, Duquesne University, Pittsburgh, USA
- 133. Ms. Ananya Tritipthumrongchok, General Manager, International Peace and Development Ethics Centre, Kaeng Krachan, Thailand.
- 134. Prof. Duunjian Tsai, M.D., PhD., Professor, Taipei Medical University, Taiwan.
- 135. Prof. Connie Ulrich, Department of Biobehavioral Health Sciences, University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing, Philadelphia, USA
- 136. Prof. Erick Valdés, Universisad del Desarrollo, Chile
- 137. Prof. Robert M. Veatch, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington DC, USA
- 138. Prof. J. David Velleman, Professor of Philosophy and Bioethics, New York University, New York. USA
- 139. Dr. Ford Vox, Brain Injury Medicine, Shepherd Center, Atlanta, USA

- 140. Dr. Gary I. Wadler, Past Chairman, World Anti-Doping Agency (WADA) Prohibited List Committee, Recipient of the International Olympic Committee's President's Prize in 1993, Manhasset, USA.
- 141. Mr. Wendell Wallach, Lecturer, Yale Interdisciplinary Center for Bioethics, New Haven, USA
- 142. Prof. Vivian Welch, School of Epidemiology, Public Health and Preventive Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada
- 143. Prof. Bruce Wilcox, Faculty of Public Health, Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand
- 144. Prof. Benjamin Wilfond, Director, Treuman Katz Center for Pediatric Bioethics, Seattle Children's Research Institute, Department of Pediatrics, University of Washington, Seattle, USA
- 145. Prof. Loren Wissner Greene, Department of Population Health and Bioethics, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, New York University Langone Medical Center, New York, USA
- 146. Prof. Wendy L. Wobeser, Division of Infectious Diseases, Queen's University, Kingston, Canada
- 147. Prof. Paul Root Wolpe, Asa Griggs Candler Professor of Bioethics and Director, Center for Ethics, Emory University, Atlanta, USA
- 148. Prof. Sanni Yaya, School of International Development and Global Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada.
- 149. Prof. Boris Yudin, Department of Humanitarian Expertise and Bioethics, Institute of Philosophy, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, Russia
- 150. Dr. Diana Zuckerman, President, National Center for Health Research, Washington DC, USA

## **Appendix:** WHO and IOC in Partnership

WHO has a decades-long, high-level partnership with the International Olympic Committee. That partnership was last affirmed in 2010 at an event where the Director General of WHO and President of the IOC signed a Memorandum of Understanding, which is secret because neither has disclosed it.<sup>17</sup>

Inappropriately, WHO sees its role as not just providing public health advice. It established a "Virtual Interdisciplinary Advisory Group", whose "important promotional point," according to WHO is "that the Group can help in bidding for major events (like the Olympic Games)". <sup>18</sup> That is a clear conflict of interest, when WHO must also evaluate and make recommendations about Olympic travel during a Public Health Emergency of International Concern (PHEIC).

The overly close relationship between WHO and the IOC is apparent in the comments of WHO's Executive Director responsible for Zika, just days after it was declared a PHIEC:

"Brazil is going to have a fantastic Olympics and it's going to be a successful Olympics and the world is going to go there. I just wish I was going there, but there's not going to be a lot of problems there by then." <sup>19</sup>

With respect, this is a troubling statement. WHO cannot credibly assess the public health risks of Zika and the Olympics when it sets neutrality aside. Declaring that "it's going to be a successful Olympics and the world is going to be there" implies that WHO has given the Olympics an unconditional green light, without regard to rapidly emerging medical, entomological, and epidemiological evidence—all of which must be considered in assessing whether this mass gathering could accelerate the global spread of the Brazilian strain of Zika virus. To prejudge that "there's not going to be a lot of problems" before reviewing this evidence is extremely inappropriate of WHO, and suggests that a change in leadership may be required to restore WHO's credibility.

## REFERENCES

1 Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, "CDC and OSHA Issue Interim Guidance for Protecting Workers from Occupational Exposure to Zika Virus", April 22, 2016. Available at: http://www.cdc.gov/media/releases/2016/s0422-interim-guidance-zika.html.

- 2 Rasmussen SA, Jamieson DJ, Honein MA, Petersen LR. Zika Virus and Birth Defects Reviewing the Evidence for Causality. *NEJM* 2016; DOI: 10.1056/NEJMsr1604338.
- 3 Cao-Lormeau V-M, Blake A, Mons S, et al. Guillain-Barré Syndrome outbreak associated with Zika virus infection in French Polynesia: a case-control study. *Lancet* 2016; 387:1531-39.
- 4 Mlakar J, Korva M, Tul N, et al. Zika virus associated with microcephaly. *NEJM* 2016; 374:951-58.
- 5 Cugola FR, Fernandes IR, Russo FB, et al. The Brazilian Zika virus strain causes birth defects in experimental models. *Nature* 2016; DOI:10.1038/nature18296. See also Miner JJ, Cao B, Govero J, et al, Zika Virus Infection during Pregnancy in Mice Causes Placental Damage and Fetal Demise. *Cell* 2016;165:1081-91.
- 6 Garcez PP, Loiola EC, Madeiro da Costa R, et al. Zika virus impairs growth in human neurospheres and brain organoids. *Science* 2016; DOI: 10.1126/science.aaf6116. See also Tang H, Hammack C, Ogden SC, et al. Zika Virus Infects Human Cortical Neural Progenitors and Attenuates Their Growth. *Cell Stem Cell* 2016; 18(5):587-90.
- 7 Carod-Artal FJ, Wichmann O, Farrar J, Gascón J. Neurological complications of dengue virus infection. *Lancet Neurology* 2013;12(9): 906-19.
- 8 Ministério da Saúde, Secretaria de Vigilância em Saúde. Boletim Epidemiológico 2016;47(20). Available at http://portalsaude.saude.gov.br/images/pdf/2016/maio/17/2016-016---Dengue-SE16-publica----o.pdf.
- 9 Ministério da Saúde. Informe Epidemiólogico #26/2016: Monitoramento dos dos de microcefalia no Brasil. Available at http://portalsaude.saude.gov.br/images/pdf/2016/maio/18/Informe-Epidemiol--gico-n---26--SE-19-2016--16mai2016-19h00.pdf.
- 10 Ministério da Saúde. Ministério divulga boletim epidemiológico sobre microcefalia. Available at http://portalsaude.saude.gov.br/index.php/o-ministerio/principal/secretarias/svs/noticias-svs/20929-ministerio-divulga-boletim-epidemiologico-sobre-microcefalia.
- 11 The Prefeitura da Cidade do Rio de Janeiro publishes monthly datasets of dengue by neighbourhood at http://www.rio.rj.gov.br/web/sms/exibeconteudo?id=2815389.
- 12 Agence France Presse, "Rio governor declares health sector emergency ahead of Olympics", December 24, 2015. Available at http://sports.yahoo.com/news/rio-governor-declares-health-sector-emergency-ahead-olympics-183710439--oly.html.
- 13 Carina Bacelar, "Ministro da Saúde diz que não há expectativa para aumentar recursos da area" *O Globo* May 13, 2016. Available at http://oglobo.globo.com/rio/verba-para-combate-dengue-caiu-20-de-2014-para-2015-19243518.
- 14 Severo OP. Eradication of the Aëdes aegypti mosquito from the Americas. (1955). Yellow fever, a symposium in commemoration of Carlos Juan Finlay, 1955. Paper 6. Available at http://jdc.jefferson.edu/yellow\_fever\_symposium/6.

- 15 Messina JP, Kraemer MUG, Brady OJ, et al. Mapping global environmental suitability for Zika virus. *eLife* 2016;10.7554/eLife.15272. See also Monaghan AJ, Morin CW, Steinhoff D, et al. On the Seasonal Occurrence and Abundance of the Zika Virus Vector Mosquito Aedes Aegypti in the Contiguous United States. *PLoS Currents Outbreaks* 2016; doi: 10.1371/currents.outbreaks.50dfc7f46798675fc63e7d7da563da76.
- 16 Musso D, Stramer SL, et al. Zika virus: a new challenge for blood transfusion. *Lancet* 2016;387:1993-4.
- 17 WHO. WHO and the International Olympic Committee sign agreement to improve healthy lifestyles. July 21, 2010. Available at http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/releases/2010/ioc\_20100721/en/.
- 18 WHO. Global Forum on Mass Gatherings. Rome, Italy, 26-29 October 2009. Available at http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/70616/1/WHO\_HSE\_GAR\_SIH\_2011.1\_eng.pdf.
- 19 Tribune news services, "Zika virus will be 'way down' before Rio hosts Olympics, U.N. predicts" *Chicago Tribune*, February 19, 2016. Available at http://www.chicagotribune.com/news/nationworld/ct-zika-olympics-brazil-20160219-story.html.